

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

10 ALEXANDER RAMIREZ,

11 Plaintiff.

12 v.

13 CITY OF LOS ANGELES, LOS
14 ANGELES POLICE DEPARTMENT,
15 OFFICER EDGER GARCIA, OFFICER
16 NICHOLAS VIRZI, and DOES 1 to 10,
inclusive,

17 Defendants.

CASE NO. 2:25-cv-03083 SB (MBKx)

*Assigned to: Hon. Judge Stanley Blumenfeld, Jr.,
USDC-1st Cthse, Ctrm 6C; Hon. Mag. Michael B.
Kaufman, USDC-Roybal Bldg, Ctrm. 550*

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

18
19 **1. GENERAL**

20 1.1 Purposes and Limitations. Discovery in this action is likely to involve
21 production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special
22 protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting
23 this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and
24 petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
25 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or
26 responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and
27 use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential
28 treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as

1 set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle
2 them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
3 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
4 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

5 1.2 Good Cause Statement. This action is likely to involve trade secrets,
6 customer and pricing lists and other valuable research, development, commercial,
7 financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection from
8 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action
9 is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of,
10 among other things, confidential government personnel information, peace officer
11 records, confidential law enforcement video and audio recordings, law enforcement
12 investigatory materials, (including information implicating privacy rights of third
13 parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be
14 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court
15 rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of
16 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
17 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep
18 confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such
19 material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the
20 end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such
21 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information
22 will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so
23 designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential,
24 non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public
25 record of this case.

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 **2. DEFINITIONS**

2 2.1 Action: this pending federal lawsuit, *Alexander Ramirez v. City of Los*
3 *Angeles, et al.*, Case No. 2:25-cv-03083 SB (MBKx).

4 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
5 of information or items under this Order.

6 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
7 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
8 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
9 Cause Statement.

10 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
11 support staff).

12 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
13 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
14 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

15 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
16 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
17 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
18 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

19 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
20 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
21 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

22 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
23 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
24 counsel.

25 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
26 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

27 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
28 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have

1 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that
2 has appeared on behalf of that party, including support staff.

3 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
4 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
5 support staffs).

6 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
7 Discovery Material in this Action.

8 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
9 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
10 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
11 and their employees and subcontractors.

12 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
13 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

14 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
15 from a Producing Party.

16 2.16 Final Disposition: The conclusion of any appellate proceedings, or, if no
17 appeal is taken, when the time for filing of an appeal has run. Except as set forth
18 below, the terms of this protective order apply through FINAL DISPOSITION of the
19 action. The parties may stipulate that they will be contractually bound by the terms
20 of this agreement beyond FINAL DISPOSITION, but will have to file a separate
21 action for enforcement of the agreement once all proceedings in this case are
22 complete.

23 24 **3. SCOPE**

25 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
26 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted
27 from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of
28

Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the court-filed information to be introduced that was previously designated as confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City and Cty. of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Stipulated Protective Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this

1 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
2 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
3 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
4 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
5 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
6 this Order.

7 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
8 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
9 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
10 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
11 to sanctions.

12 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
13 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
14 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

15 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
16 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
17 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
18 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
19 produced.

20 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

21 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
22 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the
23 Producing Party affix, at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter
24 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
25 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
26 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
27 markings in the margins).

1 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
2 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
3 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
4 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
5 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
6 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
7 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing
8 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
9 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions
10 of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
11 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
12 margins).

13 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the
14 Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition.

15 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any
16 other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior
17 of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
18 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
19 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
20 portion(s).

21 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
22 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
23 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
24 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
25 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
26 Order.

27 ///

28 ///

1 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

2 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
3 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
4 Scheduling Order.

5 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
6 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1, et seq., as modified by Judge Kaufman's
7 Procedures. *See* <https://www.cacd.uscourts.gov/honorable-michael-b-kaufman>. Any
8 discovery motion must strictly comply with these procedures.

9 6.3 Burden. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding
10 shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an
11 improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
12 other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
13 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
14 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled
15 under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.
16

17 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

18 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
19 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
20 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
21 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
22 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving
23 Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

24 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
25 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
26 authorized under this Order.

27 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
28 otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a

1 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
2 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

3 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as
4 employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
5 disclose the information for this Action;

6 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
7 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

8 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
9 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
10 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11 (d) the Court and its personnel;

12 (e) court reporters and their staff;

13 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors
14 to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
17 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

18 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
19 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party
20 requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will
21 not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
22 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
23 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed
24 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be
25 separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as
26 permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

27 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually
28 agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

1 **8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED**
2 **PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

3 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
4 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
5 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

6 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
7 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
9 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena
10 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
11 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

12 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
13 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

14 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
15 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action
16 as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena
17 or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The
18 Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court
19 of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as
20 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful
21 directive from another court.

22
23 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
24 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

25 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
26 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
27 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
28

remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this Court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the Court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this Court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts

1 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
2 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
3 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
4 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

5
6 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
7 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

8 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
9 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
10 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
11 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
12 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
13 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
14 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
15 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
16 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
17 to the Court.

18
19 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

20 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
21 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

22 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
23 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
24 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
25 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
26 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

27 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
28 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may

1 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
2 Protected Material at issue; good cause must be shown in the request to file under
3 seal. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the Court,
4 then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless
5 otherwise instructed by the Court.

6
7 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

8 After the final disposition of this Action, within 60 days of a written request by
9 the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the
10 Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected
11 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other
12 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected
13 Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written
14 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
15 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where
16 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed, and (2) affirms
17 that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations,
18 summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.
19 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
20 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
21 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product,
22 and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected
23 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material
24 remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 **14. VIOLATION OF ORDER**

2 Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
3 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
4 sanctions.

5
6 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

7
8 Dated: June 16, 2025 MGDESYAN LAW FIRM

9 /s/ Christina Azoian
10 GEORGE G. MGDESYAN, ESQ.
11 CHRISTINA AZOIAN, ESQ.
12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff,*
13 ALEXANDER RAMIREZ

14
15 Dated: June 16, 2025 **HYDEE FELDSTEIN SOTO**, City Attorney
16 **DENISE C. MILLS**, Chief Deputy City Attorney
17 **KATHLEEN KENEALY**, Chief Assistant City Attorney
18 **CORY M. BRENT**, Senior Assistant City Attorney

19 By: Ty A. Ford
20 TY A. FORD, Deputy City Attorney
21 *Attorneys for Defendants, CITY OF LOS ANGELES*
22 and LOS ANGELES POLICE

23 IT IS SO ORDERED.
24 DATED: June 17, 2025


25 
26 MICHAEL B. KAUFMAN
27 UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [full name], of _____
_____ [address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its
entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the
United States District Court for the Central District of California on _____
in the case of *Alexander Ramirez. v. City of Los Angeles, et al.*, Case No. 2:25-cv-
03083 SB (MBKx). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so
comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I
solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that
is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict
compliance with the provisions of this Stipulated Protective Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [full name]
of _____ [address and telephone number]
as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any
proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Signature: _____
Printed Name: _____
Date: _____
City and State Where Sworn and Signed: _____